| **Student Name:** Josephine She |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This House would place an emphasis on holistic learning over standardised testing in schools |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | **1** | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 68.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Good opening! Clear explanation of how academics are super important and centred right now.  Set-up   * Can we explain what the status quo is and how our world differs? * Good on expansive nature of schooling and weighting of different subjects. * We should also highlight what the problem with ST is - and what school looks like right now.   Argument 1   * We need to explain why there is a need for holistic learning - why is ST so bad, and what has it led to? * Good on interests and being able to grow more. We want to compare this to ST; holistic learning emphasises deep understanding and application of knowledge, fostering a lifelong love of learning. Standardised testing, with its focus on rote memorization, often leads to superficial understanding and quick forgetting after the test. Holistic approaches encourage exploration, inquiry-based learning, and project-based learning, leading to more meaningful and lasting learning experiences. This isn’t just about the increase in subjects, but also the methodology of teaching. * Good on how university may change.   Why are our benefits exclusive?  04:04  We need to ask POIs consistently. | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Ellie Fu |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This House would place an emphasis on holistic learning over standardised testing in schools. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 68.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Why is ST more important? Why does HL have biases and is unfair? We make lots of claims up top without much substantiation, it doesn’t answer the questions Josephine’s speech raises.  Stance - why will we keep ST; you’re establishing the counterfactual now rather than your stance, which is a value statement about why your side is good.  Rebuttal   * I think we need to ask whether there is a need for this. Good job pointing out that extracurriculars can exist. We should unpack this further and question what is exclusive about the benefits of Prop. * POI - explain how keeping these instruments as hobbies is good, because it occurs in non-stressful environments. * Do all students have an incentive to be so well rounded? Wouldn’t the world change if we adjusted this, hence meaning learning an instrument does become valued by society.   Argument 1   * Fair on differential benefits; but doesn’t this exist in the status quo as well? Some people are more naturally inclined towards maths?   + We can also link this to learning gaps - standardised tests can help identify students who are struggling in specific areas and provide them with targeted support. * What did we prove here before we moved onto the second argument? Are these two different arguments?   Argument 2   * What is the claim of this argument?   We need to defend the positives of standardised testing! That it is a measurable way to assess student learning and hold schools accountable for their performance.  04:13  We need to ask POIs! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Emilia Lau |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This House would place an emphasis on holistic learning over standardised testing in schools. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Why is this useful? Explain how it is, with reference to the answer Ellie has to the POI Theo asks. Are instruments valuable? Should they be valuable? Should we make sure that schools aren’t just academic and more expansive.  Rebuttal   * POI: isn’t the point of school to challenge you to grow? * Good on differences in benefits and advantages balancing out at the end of the day.   Argument 1   * Good work starting by establishing the status quo. * We want to compare this to ST; holistic learning emphasises deep understanding and application of knowledge, fostering a lifelong love of learning. * Standardised testing, with its focus on rote memorization, often leads to superficial understanding and quick forgetting after the test. Holistic approaches encourage exploration, inquiry-based learning, and project-based learning, leading to more meaningful and lasting learning experiences. * This isn’t just about the increase in subjects, but also the methodology of teaching.   This is a much clearer speech. Good improvement.  04:05  Let’s ask POIs consistently! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Cyrus Yuan |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This House would place an emphasis on holistic learning over standardised testing in schools. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | **1** | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Our opening is good, but verges on uncharitable re laundry. I think we want instead explain why their benefits are just not exclusive. Explain how your side achieves the same benefits, but having these be taught at home or in the form of hobbies.  Rebuttal   * Good work trying to systematise the responses.   + Comfort zone - fair on helping it being missing. Good on access to this on your own side.   + Unrealistic - jobs and careers; this is easy to respond to. You need more than maths and english skills to do well in the workplace - rather, you need communication skills and so on.   Argument 1   * Good work starting by establishing what a standardised test is. * Did we engage with bias meaningfully? Doesn’t this exist in the status quo as well? Some people are more naturally inclined towards maths?   + We could link this to learning gaps - standardised tests can help identify students who are struggling in specific areas and provide them with targeted support. * Is this new?   We have to spend more time explaining why you have better holistic learning - imagine your favourite hobby becomes a test, and it becomes stressful and you lose all interest.  We need to defend the positives of standardised testing! That it is a measurable way to assess student learning and hold schools accountable for their performance.  We need to ask POIs consistently.  04:38 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Theo Lee |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This House would place an emphasis on holistic learning over standardised testing in schools. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Give me a high impact opening! Don’t just jump to signposting.  Good work clarifying this. Explain how there is an element of choice - so you do music, but do in fact choose your instrument etc. Point out why there is a need for this; what is going wrong with ST such that this is necessary. Explain why the social growth and physical growth matters so much and is being stumped at the moment.  We had clashes, but then after our clarification we jumped to rebuttal? The structure in this speech is off!  Rebuttal   * Good comparison to AP. * We need to bring back stress and the value of mental health. Why is mental health not particularly strong in the status quo? * Good on perseverance - point out that school is meant to challenge you! School isn’t meant to be easy!   Point out on careers, how soft skills matter a lot and they pretend they don’t!  What culture or kind of test is ST? For instance, right and wrong, clear scores, percentiles and rankings. Ask what matters or is necessary for societal and child development.  We need to ask POIs consistently.  03:02 - we need to push ourselves to hit 4! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Tongtong Lai |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This House would place an emphasis on holistic learning over standardised testing in schools. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | **1** | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  This opening doesn’t work because they did, and then Theo clarified how it works. If you want to point out this is inexclusive, or that there is a problem solution gap - which is what your response basically is, say that instead! Good opening.  Don’t do extraneous rebuttals, just do clashes please.  Rebuttal   * I think we want to point out that they increase tests and make life worse. You need to explain how now their hobbies get stressful too; for instance, what used to be an outlet becomes something you get tested on. This is the response you need to run! * Why don’t we want to set any expectations? Shouldn’t schools try to make sure you are doing okay or are being challenged to grow constantly? * Good on lack of exclusivity. Explain why your side teaches these lessons better; maybe not through ST, but rather through hobbies etc. * Good work trying to recharacterize growth.   What is the structure of this speech? You moved to your clash at 03:45…?  Our tone is a lot stronger and clearer today! Well done!  04:21  We need to ask POIs consistently. | | | | | | |